

# Briefing note on the Integrity Initiative

*Working Group on Syria Propaganda and Media*

*10 December 2018*

## Contents

|          |  |           |
|----------|--|-----------|
| <b>1</b> | <b>Executive summary</b>   | <b>2</b>  |
| <b>2</b> | <b>List of documents released</b>  | <b>3</b>  |
| 2.1      | UK-related documents . . . . .   | 4         |
| 2.2      | Other regional / national clusters . . . . .   | 5         |
| 2.3      | Second tranche of documents . . . . .  | 5         |
| <b>3</b> | <b>Sources of funding for the Integrity Initiative</b>                                   | <b>7</b>  |
| 3.1      | Russian Language Strategic Communication Programme . . . . .                             | 7         |
| 3.2      | Co-funding . . . . .   | 8         |
| <b>4</b> | <b>The internal handbook of the Integrity Initiative</b>                                 | <b>9</b>  |
| 4.1      | Offices and team . . . . .   | 9         |
| 4.2      | Seminar programme . . . . .  | 10        |
| <b>5</b> | <b>Relationships of the Integrity Initiative to other organizations</b>                  | <b>11</b> |
| 5.1      | Partners listed on the Integrity Initiative website . . . . .                            | 11        |
| 5.2      | Organizations listed in the documents as associated with the Integrity Initiative        | 11        |
| <b>6</b> | <b>Integrity Initiative Cluster members</b>  | <b>12</b> |
| 6.1      | FCO staff listed in the documents . . . . .  | 13        |
| 6.2      | Ministry of Defence officials in the UK Cluster . . . . .                                | 14        |
| 6.3      | UK journalists named as part of the UK cluster: . . . . .                                | 16        |
| 6.4      | Responses from UK journalists named in the documents . . . . .                           | 17        |
| <b>7</b> | <b>Links of the Integrity Initiative with extremism in the Baltic States and Ukraine</b> | <b>20</b> |
| 7.1      | Holocaust revisionism . . . . .  | 21        |
| 7.2      | Neo-Nazism . . . . .   | 21        |
| 7.3      | Hate campaign against the Russian Orthodox Church . . . . .                              | 22        |
| <b>8</b> | <b>Activities of the Integrity Initiative in the US</b>                                  | <b>22</b> |
| <b>9</b> | <b>History of the Institute for Statecraft</b>   | <b>23</b> |
| 9.1      | Founding . . . . .   | 23        |
| 9.2      | Youth work . . . . .   | 25        |
| 9.3      | EU lobbying . . . . .  | 25        |

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| 9.4 Other companies directed by Donnelly and Lafayeedney . . . . .                   | 25        |
| <b>10 Christopher Nigel Donnelly</b>   | <b>26</b> |
| <b>11 Daniel Lafayeedney</b>   | <b>27</b> |
| <b>12 St Antony’s College Oxford and the Pluscarden Programme</b>                    | <b>28</b> |
| <b>13 Charities with Donnelly and Lafayeedney as trustees</b>                        | <b>29</b> |
| 13.1 Forward Thinking . . . . .  | 29        |
| 13.2 Active Change Foundation . . . . .  | 30        |
| <b>14 Council on Foreign Relations LLP</b>   | <b>30</b> |
| <b>15 Scottish Limited Partnerships and Limited Liability Partnerships</b>           | <b>30</b> |
| <b>16 Physical location</b>  | <b>31</b> |
| <b>17 Charitable status of the Institute of Statecraft</b>                           | <b>32</b> |
| 17.1 Publicly declared charitable purposes and privately stated objectives . . . .   | 32        |
| 17.2 Office of the Scottish Charity Regulator’s criteria for making a complaint: . . | 33        |
| <b>18 The Scottish angle</b>   | <b>34</b> |
| <b>19 Acknowledgements</b>   | <b>34</b> |

Draft only, work in progress and not fully checked, do not quote publicly.

## 1 Executive summary

- The [Integrity Initiative](#) now accounts for most of the budget of a Scottish-registered charity named the [Institute for Statecraft](#) founded by Daniel Lafayeedney and Christopher Nigel Donnelly in 2006. Most of the funding for this programme – about £2.6 million / year – is coming from the FCO’s Russian Language Strategic Communication Programme.
- A close examination of past and present posts held by individuals associated with the Integrity Initiative indicates that specialists in military intelligence and other senior military personnel with responsibility for strategic communication (StratCom) operations are closely involved in the programme.
- The activities of the Integrity Initiative include:
  - setting up covert networks (“clusters”) of journalists, academics and military/foreign service StratCom practitioners in each country including the UK: “The programme has begun to create a critical mass of individuals from across society (think tanks, academia, politics, the media, government and the military)

whose work is proving to be mutually reinforcing.”

- covert manipulation of the public sphere, including campaigns to smear and suppress dissenters and [block their appointment](#) to posts. The “silencing of pro-Kremlin voices on Serbian TV” is listed as an “achievement”.
- attacks on British politicians, academics and other critics of UK government policies, most notably attacks on the Leader of the Opposition and his office staff.
- in the Baltic states and Ukraine, working closely with organizations and governments that foment hatred of ethnic Russian minorities and encourage Holocaust revisionism.
- promotion of a hate campaign against the Russian Orthodox Church in the Balkans.
- These activities:
  - are not the charitable purposes set out in the Institute of Statecraft’s constitution, and are not charitable purposes in general
  - violate accepted limits of the purposes for which UK government funding may be used
  - indicate that the Government has misled the House of Commons Foreign Affairs Committee about the scope of the Russian Language Strategic Communication Programme.
- There are serious concerns about the transparency of the Institute for Statecraft.
  - Its registered corporate address is a derelict building in rural Scotland which is [being demolished](#) and it is not clear how the costs of office rental in London are being covered.
  - Co-located (in this derelict building) with the charity named Institute of Statecraft is a Scottish Limited Liability Partnership (LLP) directed by Lafayeedney and Donnelly, set up a few months after the Institute of Statecraft was granted charitable status. This LLP has a company name that is identical to that of a respected US [foreign policy think tank](#) and could easily be confused with it.
  - Scottish LLPs are notorious as a [vehicle for non-transparent financial transfers](#).
  - In a High Court [judgement](#) in 2006 against Lafayeedney, the judge commented adversely on his probity and his business methods.

## 2 List of documents released

A first tranche of documents relating to the Integrity Institute were released on 5 November 2018, and a second tranche on 29 November. The Integrity Institute has [confirmed](#) that a

leak of documents occurred, but described the documents as follows:

*Although it is clear that much of the material was indeed on the Integrity Initiative or Institute systems, much of it is dated and was never used. In particular, many of the names published were on an internal list of experts in this field who had been considered as potential invitees to future cooperation. In the event, many were never contacted by the Integrity Initiative and did not contribute to it.*

There are no signs that the documents have been tampered with although they contain minor mistakes such as misspelt names.

## 2.1 UK-related documents

1. [FCO application form 2017-18](#) Signed by Chris Donnelly, dated 27 April 2017.
2. [FCO application 2018 v2](#) Also signed by Chris Donnelly, also dated 27 April 2017
3. [FCO proposal integrity budget 2017-18](#)
4. [Integrity 2018 Activity Budget v3](#) Quarterly budget projection for 2018-19.
5. [Top three deliverables for FCO](#) This appears to be the applicants' response to points raised by the FCO's reviewers of the grant application for 2018-19. Date inferred to be close to 8 June 2018.
6. [II handbook v2](#) of the Integrity Initiative dated 30 May 2018.
7. [The Integrity Initiative Guide to Countering Russian Disinformation May 2018](#)
8. [Cluster Roundup Jul18](#) Progress report on establishing national clusters.
9. [Cluster Leaders](#)
10. [Cluster Participants](#) List of all cluster participants
11. [xcountry](#) Table of countries with election dates, institutions, and individuals associated with the Integrity Initiative. This suggests an intention to influence the outcomes of these elections.
12. [Moncloa campaign](#) apparently dated 8 June 2018 and submitted as supporting material with the applicants' response to FCO reviewers. Timeline of social media output during Integrity Initiative's successful campaign to block the appointment of Colonel Pedro Baños Bajo to the post of head of the National Security Directorate of Spain. Includes a list of seven individuals under the heading "UK II team Twitter impact: Influential Individuals Social Media activity".
13. [UK Cluster](#)

## 2.2 Other regional / national clusters

[Austria cluster](#) Includes no Austrians yet. The only names listed are Harold Elletson, a British former politician reported to have undertaken covert activities on behalf of MI6 in the 1990s, and Susan Stewart of the Stiftung Wissenschaft und Politik in Berlin

15. [Baltics Cluster](#) Includes two FCO people: Major Jane Witt and Ms Claire Lawrence (UK Ambassador to Lithuania), and James Rogers at the Baltic Defence College.
16. [Central Eastern Cluster](#) Includes Anne Bader, based in Washington DC whose CV includes ARAG and Atlantic Council
17. [France Cluster](#)
18. [Germany Cluster](#)
19. [Greece Cluster](#)
20. [Italy Cluster](#)
21. [Netherlands Cluster](#) Three State Dept officials are listed.
22. [Nordic Clusters](#)
23. [Spain Cluster](#) Francis Ghiles and Charles Powell appear on this
24. [USA&Canada Cluster](#)

A file named `xOutreach` contains only a single record, for Marcel R. D. Chirwa who is Permanent Representative for Malawi to the UN office in Nairobi.

A summary of this material is given on an [English-language blog by a German journalist](#)

## 2.3 Second tranche of documents

A second tranche of documents was released on [29 November](#).

### 2.3.1 Germany

- [THE GERMAN CLUSTER - INTERIM REPORT](#) By Hannes Adomeit 03/10/2018  
German cluster supervised by a British expert Harold Elletson.
- Elletson's research (in German) distributed as a manual for the German establishment  
<https://www.scribd.com/document/394375297/Germany-Paper>
- Elletson's research (in English) <https://www.scribd.com/document/394374962/English-Version-High>
- outline of the research <https://www.scribd.com/document/394376358/Outline-of>
- claim for reimbursement <https://www.scribd.com/document/394374786/Claim-for-Reimbursement-and>

### 2.3.2 Spain

- Cluster breakdown <https://www.scribd.com/document/394376539/SPAIN-Network>
- Consultancy agreement with Nico de Pedro
- invoice to the Spanish CIDOB research centre from its British supervisors <https://www.scribd.com/document/394374329/Factura-N-VEN01304-the-Institute-for-Statecraft>
- Manual for campaigns in Spain <https://www.scribd.com/document/394376716/Why-is-It-So-Difficult-to-Address-the-Russia-Issue-in-Spain>
- fake proof of Russia's interference in the Catalan independence referendum disseminated among Spanish politicians and Media <https://www.scribd.com/document/394375814/InitIntegrity-Framing-Russian-Meddling-in-CAT>

### 2.3.3 Greece

- a leading II officer Simon Bracey-Lane's report about enlisting new cluster members in the Balkans <https://www.scribd.com/document/394374625/Balkans-Trip-Report-SBL>
- Greece cluster enlistment in Thessaloniki <https://www.scribd.com/document/394374862/Cnd-Spcd-Notes>
- Contract with the second Greece cluster <https://www.scribd.com/document/394375038/F-Contract>
- Cluster meeting schedule in Thessaloniki <https://www.scribd.com/document/394375194/F-Thessaloniki>
- Covert meeting of cluster members at Sissy Alonistiotou's house in Athens <https://www.scribd.com/document/394375620/Greek-Meeting>
- Cluster report on preparing a desirable reaction to the expulsion of diplomats <https://www.scribd.com/document/394375727/II-Report-Greek-Diplomatic-Expulsions>
- Slide deck of an Estonian lecturer at the cluster meeting in Thessaloniki <https://www.scribd.com/document/394375953/Mark-Voyger-russian-Lawfare>
- Greece cluster requests for funds from the UK center <https://www.scribd.com/document/394376113/MLI-at-Proposal-for-II-1>

<https://www.scribd.com/document/394458803/MLI-at-Proposal-for-II-2>

- Cluster's review of media coverage of Salisbury poisonings <https://www.scribd.com/document/394376463/Scripal-Case>
- 2017 cluster breakdown <https://www.scribd.com/document/394375411/Greece>

- cluster research on alleged agents of Russian influence in Greece, aimed at defaming the leaders of Syriza, Ivan Savvidis and others <https://www.scribd.com/document/394376394/Russian-Influence-in-Greece-FINAL>
- Integrity Initiative team member Victor Madeira’s slides for his presentation at the Thessaloniki meeting <https://www.scribd.com/document/394376600/V-Madeira-GR-Seminar-121118>

### 3 Sources of funding for the Integrity Initiative

The domain name `integrityinitiative.net` was first [registered](#) on 22 June 2015. No information is given about the sources of funding for the Integrity Initiative before 1 July 2017, the planned start date of the first FCO grant.

#### 3.1 Russian Language Strategic Communication Programme

The applications to the FCO request funding from the **Russian Language Strategic Communication Programme**. This appears to be what is described as the “FCO-led Russian Language Programme” in the [Government’s response](#) on 20 July 2017 to the House of Commons Foreign Affairs Committee’s [report on the UK’s relations with Russia](#) published four months earlier:

*The FCO-led Russian Language Programme brings together expertise from the FCO, MOD, and DFID as well as external experts to co-ordinate a set of projects worth some £70m over four years. These projects seek to enhance independent media; to engage with Russian speakers; and to expose Russian Government disinformation.*

*Through this programme, the Government is working with a range of partners to enhance the quality of public and independent Russian language media so that it is able to provide Russian-speakers with reliable access to accurate information. The type of support given includes mentoring with UK media organisations; consultancy on programming; funded co-productions and support for regional Russian language media initiatives.*

The title of the programme and this description make clear that the stated remit of the programme was to counter disinformation and provide reliable information **in the Russian language**. Without Parliamentary oversight, this remit appears to have been changed to include operations in other languages including English-language media in the UK. As the application from the Institute of Statecraft to this programme was dated 23 April 2017 and this Government response was dated 20 July 2017, it is clear that the Government **misled the Foreign Affairs Committee** by describing the Russian Language Programme as aimed at Russian speakers and as targeting Russian language media. The hysterically anti-Russian tone of the material produced by the Integrity Initiative and its partner organizations, including a

what appears to be hate campaign against the Russian Orthodox Church, would be unlikely to find ready welcome among Russian speakers.

The total cost of the project for the financial year 2017-18 was given as £582,635 of which £480,635 was from FCO and the rest from NATO, “partner institutions” and the Lithuanian Ministry of Defence. The [budget projection for 2018-19](#) gives a budget of £1.96 million for 2018-19. In answer to a Parliamentary Question [it was confirmed](#) that all of the £1.96 million was granted by the Foreign Office.

## 3.2 Co-funding

Co-funding of the Integrity Initiative for 2018-19 is listed:

*Funding from HQ NATO Public Diplomacy, £12,000 for each inaugural workshop  
= £168,000*

*Funding from partner institutions £5,000 for each inaugural workshop = £70,000*

*Funding from NATO HQ for educational video films – free provision of camera team*

*Funding from Lithuanian MOD to provide free all costs for their stratcom team for a monthly trip to support a new hub/cluster creation and to educate cluster leaders and key people in Vilnius in infowar techniques = £20,000*

*Funding from US State Dept, £250,000 for research and dissemination activities (excluding any activity in USA)*

*Funding from Smith Richardson Foundation, £45,000 for cluster activities in Europe and USA*

*Funding from Facebook, £100,000 for research and education activities*

*Funding from German business community, £25,000 for research and dissemination in EU countries*

This would give a total income of £2.6 million for 2018-19. As discussed below, this does not include office costs, for which no funding source is given.

**The State Department quite properly stipulates that the grant funding it provides may not be spent within the United States.** The UK FCO has no such scruples about funding covert political activities within the UK.

The handbook instructs staff to say if asked about funding that:

*The IfS gets its funding from multiple sources to ensure its independence. These include: private individuals; charitable foundations; international organisations (EU, NATO); UK Govt (FCO, MOD)*



There is no other mention in the documents of funding from the UK MoD. The plan is that the “clusters” should eventually be sustained by longer-term funding from NATO and the Atlantic Treaty Association:-

*HQ NATO PDD [Public Diplomacy Division] has proved a reliable source of funding for national clusters. The ATA [Atlantic Treaty Association] promises to be the same, giving access to other pots of money within NATO and member nations.*

The role of NATO is thus being transformed from a collective defence to covert political manipulation within its member countries

## 4 The internal handbook of the Integrity Initiative

### 4.1 Offices and team

The Institute for Statecraft has an office at Two Temple Place, but it is not clear if this is also the location of the office space used by the Integrity Initiative. For the ordinary staff, the travel budgets are very low - economy-class flights and only £70/night for hotels or AirBnB.

- Stephen Dalziel - his [bio](#) includes a year on a TA attachment in the Army, followed by six years at the Soviet Studies Research Centre, Royal Military Academy, Sandhurst. From 1988 to 2004 he worked at the BBC as a Russian Affairs analyst, followed by five years as Executive Director of the Russo-British Chamber of Commerce while also working for and starting a [consultancy firm](#)
- Chris Hernon, formerly a team manager at BBC monitoring, appears to have responsibility for social media. His output indicates that he has strong views on Ukraine.
- Professor [Alan Riley](#) -
- [Julian Lindley-French](#)

*Currently Senior Fellow at the Institute of Statecraft London, Director of Europa Analytica, Distinguished Visiting Research Fellow at the National Defense University in Washington, a member of the Strategic Advisory Group at the Atlantic Council in Washington, Visiting Programme Director at Wilton Park, Honorary Fellow of the Strategy and Security Institute at the University of Exeter. He is also a Member of the Strategic Advisory Panel of the UK Chief of Defence Staff.*

- Alex Finnen - Military Intelligence officer, see below
- Simon Bracey Lane - “US & election campaign specialist”. In 2016 Bracey-Lane was [working in a field level position](#) in Bernie Sanders’s Iowa campaign headquarters. His bio is given on the website for the Adventium meeting

*Simon Bracey Lane has three years of elections experience in both the US & the UK. He has managed the distribution of communications for the Integrity Initiative*

*cluster system and for the last year been developing the Integrity Initiative's presence across Europe & the US. He has worked specifically to counter malign interference in Greece, Serbia, Montenegro, Bosnia, Lithuania and the US. This work includes the commissioning of several papers, building discussion events and the formation of a media observatory.*

- Tim Reilly - “Arctic/Russia-China specialist”. He has a diverse background including Army service and business development in emerging markets including Russia. It is not clear that he is committed to the agenda of the Integrity Initiative. An [article](#) he published in March 2017 advocates a realist approach to post-Brexit relations with Russia. Listed also as seminar speaker possibly with Carrie Gracie, a BBC journalist.
- Victor Madeira - expertise given as “Intelligence and National Security, Orthodox Church”. A [bio](#) announcing his appointment as a lecturer at the University of Buckingham stated:

*Dr Victor Madeira comes to us from Cambridge (where he has been a lecturer and tutor for four years, working with Professor Christopher Andrew and Sir Richard Dearlove) and the Institute for Statecraft in London, directed by Chris Donnelly, where he is a Senior Fellow working on 21st Century security architecture.*

## 4.2 Seminar programme

Plans for the seminar programme are described in the handbook though these seminars are not advertised publicly. Seminars listed for 2018 Q1 included the following individuals:

Other individuals or organizations listed in the planned seminar programme have no documented affiliation with the Institute of Statecraft or the Integrity Initiative

- John Rendon - founder in 1981 of the [Rendon Group](#) that helped [organize](#) the infamous Kuwaiti incubator babies story during the first Gulf War
- Eduard A - probably [Edouard Andrieu](#), formerly working at Le Monde
- Former British Army Lt-Colonel Glen Grant, who provides somewhat deranged [military advice](#) to the Kiev regime.
- Neil Barnett - former foreign correspondent and now CEO of Istok Associates Limited (“[a risk consultancy specialising in CEE and the Middle East](#)”).
- The White Helmets - speaker not specified
- John Lough - Associate Fellow of the Russia and Eurasia programme at Chatham House and former Nato representative in Russia

## 5 Relationships of the Integrity Initiative to other organizations

### 5.1 Partners listed on the Integrity Initiative website

- Barcelona Centre for International Affairs (CIDOB)
- The Beacon Project - link [beaconproject.info](http://beaconproject.info) leads to “site under construction”. The domain name was registered on 19 April 2016 in Bratislava. Appears to be [this project](#) announced by the International Republican Institute in April 2016, but has never gone live.
- Centre for European Policy Analysis (Washington DC) - Mission is “to promote an economically vibrant, strategically secure, and politically free Europe with close and enduring ties to the United States.”
- European Values (Czechia) - “non-governmental policy institute defending liberal democracy” led by Jakub Janda who is named in the documents as a member of one of the ‘clusters’.
  - Kremlin Watch (Czechia) - a strategic program of the European Values Think-Tank
- Political Capital Policy Research and Consulting Institute (Hungary)
- University of Macedonia Public Opinion Research Unit
- Res - Public Affairs. Corporate Affairs GmbH (Berlin)

### 5.2 Organizations listed in the documents as associated with the Integrity Initiative

- Bellingcat - mentioned under “sessions with partner organization sessions”
- StopFake - there are multiple references to working with them in the 2018 application and budget plan

*We also worked with Stopfake in Ukraine, examining the excellent work done on this by them and their partners*

*We also arranged for the Lithuanian team to provide training on a regular basis for all our cluster leaders in the methodology of tracking and exposing Russian malign influence and disinformation, and linked them directly to the Ukrainian Stopfake leadership and to the UK LSE team (whom we took to Vilnius) to exchange practical experience.*

*Provide guest articles from Ifs and our clusters for StopFake’s printed material published and distributed along the contact line in Eastern Ukraine*

*Sending cluster members to educational sessions abroad (IREX, Detector Media, StopFake, EUvsDisinfo, LT MOD Stratcom)*

*A modular training programme (based on IREX/StopFake material) that adapts media source examples as needed to be most relevant and accessible across our cluster network*

- Henry Jackson Society - Drew Foxall is listed as Inner Core: Russia
- Atlantic Council The Atlantic Treaty Association (ATA) is [described](#) by NATO as an umbrella organisation for the separate national associations, voluntary organisations and non-governmental organisations that formed to uphold the values of the Alliance after its creation in 1949. The Youth Atlantic Treaty Association (YATA) is the youth branch of the ATA and was formed in 1996.

The Atlantic Council is the US affiliate of the ATA. Four individuals with Atlantic Council email addresses are listed: Anders Aslund, Elizabeth Braw, Robert Nurick and Ben Nimmo

The cluster leader Savo Kentera [savo.kentera@ascg.me](mailto:savo.kentera@ascg.me) is listed as President of Atlantic Council Montenegro

- Centre for European Reform - Ian Bond, director of foreign policy
- Royal United Services Institute - Igor Sutyagin
- Chatham House - Three individuals with Chatham House emails are listed: James Nixey, Orsya Lutsevych, James Sherr
- European Council on Foreign Relations - Four individuals with ECFR emails are listed: Nika Prislan, Borja Lasheras, Kadri Liik, Manuel Lafont Rapnoul.
- Hermitage Fund Two emails: William Browder, Vadim Kleiner

## 6 Integrity Initiative Cluster members

The UK Cluster document lists the following groups

- GIG (Governance and Integrity Group) - one name
- NHS Reform Group - no names yet
- Communication Engagement & Dialogue Group - no names yet
- Defence Acquisition Reform Group - no names yet
- Office Core Team - Fellows
- Office Core Team - Associates
- UK General - Inner Core - Russia
- UK General - Inner Core - Military & Defence
- UK General - Outer Core - Russia
- UK General - Outer Core - Military & Defence
- UK Journalists

The procedure for the initial cluster foundation workshop is described as follows:

*Connect cluster members, create internal national network, formally introduce them to the Integrity Initiative aims, practices and methodologies, establish target programme for research, dissemination and events.*

*New cluster able to self-organise. Increased coordination and shared best practice from cluster individuals and organisations working at the forefront of efforts countering RU disinfo, increased resource material for an Int'l audience.*

*Initial group of at least 8 members between core hub and network. Members agree team roles and start putting structures in place. Start exchanges of information with other clusters. Begin work on research and dissemination activities*

So, at least some UK cluster members should have been invited to such a workshop, and if they attended this workshop would by default have been listed as cluster members.

## 6.1 FCO staff listed in the documents

- **Duncan Allen** - This is most likely Duncan Allan who is director of Octant Research & Analysis Ltd, an independent consultancy and Associate Fellow, Russia and Eurasia Programme at the Chatham House think tank, having retired from the FCO in 2017. A [biographical note](#) states that 'For more than 28 years he was a member of the UK Foreign & Commonwealth Office's research analysts cadre, working on the countries of the former Soviet Union, particularly Russia and Ukraine. He served at the British Embassies in Moscow and Kyiv.' In October 2018 Allan [published a paper](#) with Chatham House on the 'Salisbury attack' calling for more confrontational responses by the UK government to the attack on the Skripals which he blamed on the Russian state.
- **Catherine Crozier** [listed](#) on the Government Communication Service 'people finder' website as a Strategic Communications Advisor, Ministry of Defence.
- **Alan Parfitt** - Head of the FCO Eastern Research Group [as of August 2017](#). He has held this position [since at least 2010](#).
- **Andy Pryce** - Head of 'Counter Disinformation and Media Development' at the [Foreign and Commonwealth Office](#) in London, a position he does not advertise on his [LinkedIn page](#), which lists the following previous postings:
  - British Resident Commissioner, British High Commission, Castries - Sep 2013 – Jun 2015. Responsible for UK relations with St Lucia and St Vincent and the Grenadines.
  - Deputy Consul General British Consulate General Houston - Feb 2009 – Sep 2013. Leader on development and delivery of British Government strategy across Texas, Oklahoma, Louisiana and Arkansas.

- Head of Public Affairs, British Embassy Washington - Oct 2007 – Feb 2009. Led UK public advocacy in the US; thoroughly modernised UK outreach; integrated social media campaigning, direct mail with traditional diplomacy.
- Head of EU Affairs, British Embassy Helsinki - Dec 2003 – Oct 2007. Led UK EU advocacy in Finland during UK and Finnish Presidencies of the EU.
- Deputy Programme Manager Foreign and Commonwealth Office - 2002 – 2003 Led project to design, develop and deliver paradigm shifting new Intranet for British Foreign Service.
- **Richard Slack** [richard.slack@fco.gov.uk](mailto:richard.slack@fco.gov.uk) - In 2011 Slack [was listed](#) as based in the British Embassy in Baghdad and in 2015 he [was listed](#) as Head of Communications at the British Embassy in Kabul. His current role is unclear.
- **Joanna Szostek** [joanna.szostek@fco.gov.uk](mailto:joanna.szostek@fco.gov.uk) - Szostek is an academic and from 1 September 2018 is Lecturer in Political Communication, University of Glasgow specializing in post-Soviet media and politics. Past job as BBC monitoring journalist, then post-doc academic posts. Previously based at Royal Holloway in the University of London, Szostek [conducted a three-year Marie Skłodowska Curie \(MSC\) fellowship](#) from the European Commission on ‘the reception of rival narratives about international politics among different groups of Ukrainians’. The project incorporated a secondment to the UK Foreign and Commonwealth Office (April 2017 to August 2017), where it appears she may have crossed the radar of the Integrity Initiative.
- **Claire Lawrence** [claire.lawrence@fco.gov.uk](mailto:claire.lawrence@fco.gov.uk) - UK ambassador to Lithuania since 2015.

Most of these FCO personnel in the UK cluster are not particularly senior in the area of strategic communications and the countering of disinformation. Some have no clear experience of communications (Allan, Parfitt, Lawrence), others who have such experience are not particularly senior (Slack) or have left to work at the MoD (Crozier) . One is an academic who was only briefly seconded to the FCO as part of a research project (Szostek). With one exception there are no connections with the key FCO communications teams such as the Soft Power and External Affairs Department or the [Counter Daesh Coalition Communications Cell](#). The exception is [Andy Pryce](#) who is head of ‘counter disinformation and media development’. This is not a widely known part of the Foreign Office and this title appears in the public domain for Pryce only in relation to public events at which he has appeared, for example at [Stratcom DC](#) organised by the Atlantic Council or [in the press](#). On his [own LinkedIn page](#) he refers to himself only as a ‘diplomat’ and a ‘senior strategic advisor’.

## 6.2 Ministry of Defence officials in the UK Cluster

### 6.2.1 Key to acronyms

The [acronyms](#) embedded in the MoD email addresses give some clue to the scale and diversity of StratCom operations overseen by the Ministry of Defence.

- SGMI - Specialist Group Military Intelligence, based at at Denison Barracks, Hermitage, Berkshire
- PJHQ - Permanent Joint Headquarters, based in Northwood
  - J2 - operational intelligence division of PJHQ
- MSE - Military Strategic Effects, which has a StratCom (strategic communication) team based in Whitehall. This is a [descendant](#) of the Directorate of Forward Plans component of the Defence Operations Centre in Whitehall which became a Defence Targeting & Information Operations (DTIO) cell.
- CGS - office of Chief of General Staff (head of the Army)
- FSECC - Full Spectrum Effects Coordination Cell, a [cross-department group](#) set up in 2015 and overseen by a senior Tasking and Oversight Board chaired by Gwyn Jenkins (Deputy National Security Adviser for Conflict, Stability & Defence). The cell is based in MoD HQ in Whitehall and works, [according to a former member](#) ‘in co-operation with the Cabinet Office, HMT, FCO, DfID, Home Office, GCHQ, MI5 and SIS, principally against ISIL/Daesh.’
- 77X - [77th Brigade](#) based at Denison Barracks and responsible for “information activity”.
- XO - Executive Officer
- SO1 - staff officer level 1 (equivalent to Lt Col)
- SO3 - staff officer level 3 (equivalent to Captain)
- COMD - commander
- CGP - command group
- David Fields [david.fields163@mod.uk](mailto:david.fields163@mod.uk) UK Inner Core: Defence - his Linked-In profile states that he was “Part of a small team which wrote the UK Ministry of Defence’s strategic approach towards Russia.” but is no longer employed by the MoD.
- Alex Finnen x [SGMI-HQ-XO@mod.uk](mailto:SGMI-HQ-XO@mod.uk) UK Inner Core: Defence. [Finnen is a retired member](#) of the UK’s Foreign and Commonwealth Office (FCO) who, since retiring, has served on a variety of contracts with the EU and the UK Department for International Development (DFID). Not mentioned in his online CV is that Finnen has been involved in the Military Intelligence Reserves since 2005. Formely with the Corps of Royal Engineers (Territorial Army), he was [promoted](#) to Captain in 1994 and then Major [in 1999](#). He [transferred to the Intelligence Corps](#) as Major on 1 June 2005. In 2007 while a Major in Military Intelligence he was [Deputy Head of the OSCE presence in Albania](#). In 2010 he [was awarded](#) The Efficiency Decoration (Territorial) Medal. In 2014 [he was listed](#) as with the Parachute Regiment. In 2016 he [was again listed](#) with the Intelligence Corps.
- Giles Harris [giles.harris238@mod.uk](mailto:giles.harris238@mod.uk) UK Inner Core: Defence - [Colonel Giles Harris](#) was Commander of the enhanced Forward Presence Command in Estonia in May 2018.



- Charlie Hornick [armyCGS-CIG-SO1b@mod.uk](mailto:armyCGS-CIG-SO1b@mod.uk) UK Inner Core: Defence - US army officer seconded to the office of the Chief of the General Staff, who has recently [warned](#) of the Russian threat
- Paul Kitching [PJHQ-J2-EURASIA-SO3-3@mod.uk](mailto:PJHQ-J2-EURASIA-SO3-3@mod.uk) UK Inner Core: Defence -
- Arron Rahaman [OpsDir-MSE-StratComEurope@mod.uk](mailto:OpsDir-MSE-StratComEurope@mod.uk) UK Inner Core: Defence
- Nick Smith [FSECC-4@mod.uk](mailto:FSECC-4@mod.uk) UK Inner Core: Defence
- Nick Washer [FSECC-1@mod.uk](mailto:FSECC-1@mod.uk) UK Inner Core: Defence
- Joe Green [PJHQ-J2-OPS-SO1-1@mod.uk](mailto:PJHQ-J2-OPS-SO1-1@mod.uk) UK Inner Core: Defence
- [no name] [77X-CGP-COMD@mod.uk](mailto:77X-CGP-COMD@mod.uk) UK Inner Core: Defence - this would be the commander of the 77th Brigade, Brigadier Chris Bell. He appears elsewhere on the list with no email address. His predecessor, Alastair Aitken, also appears on the list with a private email address.

The involvement of such senior officers in military intelligence and information operations suggests that the MoD, rather than the FCO is in the driving seat of the Integrity Initiative programme.

### 6.3 UK journalists named as part of the UK cluster:

- Deborah Haynes [dhaynes@thetimes.co.uk](mailto:dhaynes@thetimes.co.uk)
- David Aaronovitch [daaronovitch@thetimes.co.uk](mailto:daaronovitch@thetimes.co.uk)
- Dominic Kennedy [dkennedy@thetimes.co.uk](mailto:dkennedy@thetimes.co.uk)
- Natalie Nougayrede [natalienougayrede@yahoo.com](mailto:natalienougayrede@yahoo.com)
- Edward Lucas [eluc@me.com](mailto:eluc@me.com)
- Neil Buckley [neil.buckley@ft.com](mailto:neil.buckley@ft.com)
- Jonathan Marcus [jonathan.marcus@bbc.co.uk](mailto:jonathan.marcus@bbc.co.uk)

Other UK journalists are listed as “UK II Team” with Twitter followers

- Paul Canning - blogger and gay rights campaigner with a focus on Ukraine
- David Leask - Chief Reporter, Herald Scotland

Borzhou Daragahi (The Independent) appears as the only individual listed under “Turkey” in the document [xcountry.pdf](#) that tabulates countries and election dates.

Three of seven journalists listed in the UK cluster are at the Times: Aaronovitch, Haynes and Kennedy. Two of these – Haynes and Kennedy – participated in an attack on members of the Working Group on Syria Propaganda and Media launched by the Times on 14 April 2018, including a front-page article, a two-page spread and an anonymous editorial. Two members of the Working Group are based at the University of Edinburgh. Unable to find



anything tying them to Russia, the Times attempted to suggest that the university was under Russian influence (based on a small grant from the Russian cultural institute Russky Mir), and that the city of Edinburgh was a base for Russian influence (based on the presence of a Sputnik office).

Following questions to the Integrity Initiative twitter account, this twitter account began ‘liking’ anonymous tweets that include [abusive and defamatory content](#) directed at members of the Working Group

## 6.4 Responses from UK journalists named in the documents

We have asked the journalists listed in the documents (as members of the UK Cluster, the Social Media Team or in the **xcountry** document listing countries with election dates) whether they have had any contact with the Integrity Initiative

Their responses can be grouped into four categories

### 6.4.1 Refusal to answer

- **Dominic Kennedy** (Times of London) and involved in Times attack on academics in April 2018. Failed to respond to question over Twitter as to whether he had heard of or was involved with II.
- **Deborah Haynes (Times of London) and involved in Times attack on academics in April 2018.** Failed to respond to question over Twitter as to whether she had heard of or was involved with II.

### 6.4.2 Denial of any association

- **David Aaronovitch (Times of London):-** When asked a neutral question over Twitter as to whether he knew of, or had had contact with, II, IfS or the UK Cluster, Aaronovitch replied *‘I have never heard of any of these three exotic entities. I think you have been hoaxed’*. He then threatened to sue:- *‘If you are trying to imply that somehow other I take my orders from shadowy psyops organisations then just say it. And I’ll sue you’*.

### 6.4.3 Attended meeting or subscribed to email list

Aric Toler of Bellingcat [reported](#) that the journalists named were just people who left their contact details at events they attended. He referred to other similar setups [direct quote needed]

- **Borzou Daragahi:** Initially denied knowledge of the II over DM communication with Professor Robinson:- *'I've never heard of the integrity initiative'* and stated *'on the record: 'I have never has any contact whatsoever with something called the integrity initiative'*. He issued a correction less than five minutes later stating *'I do receive their emails'* and that *'it goes to my junk email account'* noting also that *'I systematically subscribe to think tank email newsletters'*.

Over twitter, Daragahi quoted the II response to the leak which had stated \* He then accused Professor Robinson of *'implicitly smearing people and acting as a shill for a dictatorial rightwing regime'* and also stated *'It is bad faith to publicly present me as an object of suspicion to your network of tanky trolls for having my email address listed on a leaked document – without even shooting me a note. It's bad faith, adversarial, and sleazy'*.

#### 6.4.4 Proud to be associated with them, nothing improper

- **Edward Lucas (Times of London)** :- When questioned by RT as to his involvement with II/IfS, Edward Lucas stated *'I have not been paid by the institute. But I applaud their work in dealing with the Chekist regime's pernicious information and influence operations'*. He went on to say over Twitter, in response to questions, :- *'I don't see why one lot of people have to explain being on lists compiled by another lot of people. Private association is a cornerstone of a free society'* and that *'I have been to lots of events at the IfS. Not surprising since I have been working on these issues since the early 1990s. I recognise some names on the list of the 'clusters' and not others. Certainly we have never all been in the same room together.'*

With respect to the issue of II seeking to influence political processes in other countries, Lucas stated:- *'I'm not a lawyer, but it seems to me that quite often people in a free society combine to influence events, in their own country and in other countries. I have been trying, mostly with lamentable lack of success, to highlight the causes such as Tibet for year. Why shouldn't I?'*

On 26 November 2018, the II published a commentary by Edward Lucas titled *'West is Once Again Failing the Test Set by Russian Aggression'*.

- **David Leask** (Scottish Herald) - responded to the leak with a [12 tweet thread on Twitter](#). Leask started by describing the controversy over II raised by a Sputnik editor as an *'interesting little case study of the MO of those in the pay of the current Russian regime and its well-documented disinformation machinery.'* He stated \_

*Basically, the tactic at play here is crude: accuse critics of doing what you do yourself. You're paid by a the propaganda wing of the Vladimir Putin's govt? Somebody pointing that out? Then just say-or imply-that your critic does exactly the same.'*

Leask went on to acknowledge contact with II:

*'As a crime reporter with a strong Russian background, I have, unsurprisingly,*

*dealt with the Integrity Initiative. No secret there. We have quoted them in the Herald.'*

*Why does my name crop up in the leak? Because I tweeted something about Integrity. Yes, a tweet.*

*Sputnik has published implausible claims that Intergrity is a govt black op ... Sputnik's editor sees me mentioned as someone who has tweeted about Integrity. So, in conclusion, that fact that I have tweeted about Integrity has been leveraged in to an insinuation that I work for for or with a Nato/UK black ops that is anti-scottish and anti-Russian.*

In response to further questions from Professors Robinson and Miller, Leask claimed that II's government funding was 'hardly a secret'. In fact the funding source for II is not mentioned on its public website.

In fact, Leask has published two articles citing the II (discussed below), and has communicated with II over twitter since at least April 2017. This has included tweets referencing other II members and attacking RT/Sputnik as well as sharing jokes:

16 Nov 2017: 'I'm not in an argument. I am providing information. And that information is that the BBC and RT are not remotely similar. There is no hypocrisy here. There is a basic understanding of the difference between a kleptocracy's disinformation arm and a never-perfect free media'.

Aug 23 (2017?) : @benimmo has done fascinating work on Scottish Twitter bots and trolls and Russian disinfo'.

Aug 22 (date?) 'Anyone remotely curious about fake news and disinfo-not least from the Kremlin- should be following @InitIntegrity'

In his [article on the visit of Andriy Parubiy](#) and his [article on Russian media coverage of the Salisbury poisonings](#), Leask quotes "a spokesman for the Integrity Initiative", introducing this programme as "a network of researchers and journalists seeking to counter Russian propaganda and boost media literacy". Leask's own investigative reporting has helped to expose the misuse of Scottish Limited Partnerships as [vehicles for money laundering](#) ; it is not clear whether he is aware of the unusual use of this business structure by directors of the Institute for Statecraft.

#### 6.4.5 Responses of those listed as cluster members in other countries

- **Jakub Janda**, head of a Prague think-tank and named as the leader of the Central Eastern cluster confirmed his role:

*I am one of many people mentioned in here, as part of wide movement of folks trying to push hard against Kremlin influence operations. It is a badge of honor to be among people who are together standing up!*

#### 6.4.6 Nougayrede

In 2013, when she was editor of Le Monde, Natalie Nougayrede had a role in Syria-related information operations undertaken by French intelligence. Her role is described in Malbrunot and Chesnot's book *Les Chemins de Damas*. Under her direction, two Le Monde journalists were embedded with the Syrian rebels in May 2013 and collected samples from alleged chemical attacks for French intelligence. Le Monde was then given the scoop of reporting that these samples had tested positive for sarin at Le Bouchet (the French counterpart of Porton Down). This led to a turf war between the DGSE and the foreign ministry. Nougayred was later forced out of the editor's post, and given a job at The Guardian. [add screenshot or translation from book]

#### 6.4.7 Francis Ghilès

Francis Ghilès, a former journalist on the FT, appears in two roles.

— 'Our first cluster, set up in January 2017, is headed by an academic currently at CIDOB, a Barcelona-based think tank.'

As he is [based in Barcelona](#), he would be likely to have a role in the claims about Russian intervention in the Catalan referendum. He resurfaces later, in the section on 'Middle East/North Africa':

*The aggressiveness of Russian policy in key ME/NA countries (including Syria) and its importance for Russian influence in Europe obliges us to include an understanding of this region in our programme. We have a small research team in Jordan, comprising a political analyst and an investigative journalist, who are well disposed towards the West and keen to track and expose Russian activity in the region. We also have a specialist (former FT North Africa correspondent) on N Africa, the Sahel and Maghreb to track Russian influence in these areas for its implications for Europe. The work of these individuals is throwing up very interesting and relevant information on Russian strategy in the MENA region, including towards Iran and the Gulf, which is also most relevant to Russia's dealings with the US, UK and Europe.*

## 7 Links of the Integrity Initiative with extremism in the Baltic States and Ukraine

Some of activities of Integrity Initiative in the Baltic states and Ukraine, where people who consider themselves Russian make up large minorities, appear likely to fomenting sectarian hatred and civil conflict.

## 7.1 Holocaust revisionism

The officially-encouraged spread of Holocaust revisionism in the Baltic States has been documented in detail by the magazine [Defending History](#). Lithuania and Latvia have passed laws that [limit discourse about the Holocaust in their territories](#) and deny the role of local helpers in the Nazi genocide. In Ukraine a [law passed in 2015](#) assigned officially protected status to the OUN and other organizations that collaborated with the Nazis and played a key role in the mass murder of Jews.

The Integrity Institute is linked to governments and non-governmental organizations in the Baltic states that promote the [double genocide](#) version of Holocaust revisionism, which equates the (undisputed) political repression in the Baltic states during the years of Soviet rule to the genocide directed against the Jewish populations of those countries. In 2010 the UK ambassador to Lithuania (Simon Butt) [drafted and sent a letter](#) to the the President of Lithuania, co-signed by the ambassadors of Estonia, Finland, France, Netherlands, Norway and Sweden that expressed concern over the growing manifestations of antisemitism and denounced the “double genocide” version of history unequivocally:

*Spurious attempts are made to equate the uniquely evil genocide of the Jews with Soviet crimes against Lithuania, which, though great in magnitude, cannot be regarded as equivalent in either their intention or result.*

It appears that the Lithuanian armed forces have been training the British Army’s 77th Brigade:

*Lithuania has become particularly important in our network due to its expertise in dealing with Russian malign influence and disinformation. We currently have four centres of expertise in Lithuania. Since 2015 we have had a close link with the Lithuanian Armed Forces Stratcom team, currently drawing on their expertise, with the support of the Lithuanian Chief of Defence, to educate other national clusters on effective methodologies for tracking Russian activities. We initiated a link between this team and the UK 77 Bde, resulting in 77 Bde adopting the Lithuanian techniques.*

## 7.2 Neo-Nazism

StopFake, which is closely linked to the Integrity Initiative, has downplayed or denied resurgence of Nazism in the Baltic states and Ukraine. In this [article](#) StopFake defends military boot camps for children run by the [Azov Battalion](#). The Azov Battalion was founded in 2014, and its first commander was Andriy Biletsky, who previously headed the neo-Nazi group Patriot of Ukraine. The US Congress has [banned](#) the use of US aid for provision of “arms, training or other assistance to the Azov Battalion”.

StopFake has [defended](#) Ukrainian parliamentary speaker Andriy Parubiy against French commentators who have denounced him as a Nazi. When Parubiy visited Scotland, David Leask, one of the journalists listed by Integrity Initiative on its social media team, [reported](#)

in almost identical terms to the earlier StopFake defence of Parubiy following his visit to France, Parubiy is now “on the centre-right” in Ukrainian politics. As the centre ground in Ukrainian politics is now aligned with policies that in most other European countries would be identified as those of the extreme right, it is difficult to dispute the assertion that Parubiy is on the centre-right in Ukrainian politics. In this report Leask quotes the Integrity Initiative’s spokesman as saying:

*Putin’s authoritarian, militaristic, nationalistic regime is far closer to fascism. Ukraine does have far-right radicals but they get a negligible share of the vote. The history of Ukrainian nationalism is more complex than ‘they collaborated with the Nazis’.*

### 7.3 Hate campaign against the Russian Orthodox Church

The Integrity Initiative handbook and the UK Cluster document list Victor Madeira as part of the Office Core Team with expertise on “Orthodox Church”. The [slide presentation](#) that he prepared for a meeting at the University of Macedonia (Thessaloniki) on 12 November 2018 has the title “The Russian Orthodox Church: a State Tool of malign influence”. The opening slide is a cartoon, that, with some substitution of religious identifiers, would not have been out of place in the pages of *Der Stürmer*. It shows the face of an Orthodox cleric as the front of a locomotive, holding what appears to be a purse. Other parts of the locomotive are labelled with dollar signs, a hammer and sickle, and the name Russkiy Mir (the Russian cultural foundation). A uniformed driver with rodent-like features leans out of the engine room, which is labelled USSR. Other material in the documents leaves little doubt that this is part of a systematic campaign to foment sectarianism against the Russian Orthodox Church, in a region where this could have uncontrollable consequences. In this context it is surprising that the name of [Dr David Ryall](#), Secretary of the International Affairs Department of the Catholic Bishops Conference of England and Wales, appears in the UK Cluster document under “UK General - Inner Core - Military & Defence”.

## 8 Activities of the Integrity Initiative in the US

One of the points apparently raised by the FCO’s reviewers is as follows:-

*US cluster update- what’s been happening since the Q4 report? Who in the system are you engaging with at what level? (Obviously Todd has numerous contacts!)*

The applicants’ response began:

*Todd has formally retired wef last week and will work in our team after the summer. He has provided access to the Global Engagement Centre*

“Todd” appears to be Todd Leventhal, whose linked-in profile lists his present post as Strategic Adviser at the State Department’s [Global Engagement Center](#), which is charged with “leading the U.S. government’s efforts to counter propaganda and disinformation from international

terrorist organizations and foreign countries”. He does not appear to have retired yet: his Linked in entry gives the dates of this post as August 2018 to present (5 months). He is listed in the Handbook as a member of the II Team.

The applicants’ response continued:

*Our application for 501c3 status as a US registered not for profit organisation is currently going through their IR process. We have a US (DC) office to work from. We are planning our US clusters (which will be in key states, not in DC). Within DC we are partnering with C N A and CEPA. Our first partners outside DC are Adventium Labs and the Technical Leadership Institute at the University of Minnesota.*

This refers to a [conference workshop](#) at which the speakers include Chris Donnelly and Simon Bracey Lane. The applicants continued:

*Via VUB we have access to Jakub Grygiel in the State Dept planning staff and are planning for a session with him this summer*

*The Smith Richardson Foundation will work with us on developing our US network when we have received the 501c3 status*

*We also have a contact to Katharine Gorka - Senior Advisor - US Department of Homeland Security*

The Cluster roundup document notes that

*The Integrity Initiative has the opportunity to develop the programme into North America, based on the Institute’s subsidiary, the Institute for Statecraft and Governance, which has a simple office in DC and is in the course of registering as a US 501c3 not-for-profit organisation.*

Despite the State Department’s stipulation that none of the funding it provided for the Integrity Initiative should be spent in the US, it is clear that the Integrity Initiative is expanding its operations in the US with encouragement from the FCO and is working with US government officials in a manner that may not be entirely transparent to their bosses.

## 9 History of the Institute for Statecraft

### 9.1 Founding

The original company named [The Institute for Statecraft and Governance](#) was incorporated in Edinburgh in 2006, with Chris Donnelly and Dan Lafayeedney, both born in 1946, as co-founders. It was a non-profit company with articles of association stating that the company’s objects were to advance education in the field of governance, to advance human rights etc. The witness to their signatures on the articles of association was [Rosemary Cameron-Wanner](#), who gave her address as NATO HQ. She is a NATO official based in the Public Diplomacy



Division Media Operations Centre. There is no other mention of NATO in the original application for incorporation. This suggests that a NATO signature on the articles of association was a requirement for whatever they were planning next.

The company was apparently dormant until 2009 when it was [registered](#) as a Scottish charity. Its corporate HQ is in Gateshead Mills, a converted mill in a tiny hamlet in Fife. The summary of accounts on the charity register states that total income for the financial year ending 23 Nov 2017 was £521,786. However the accounts filed at Companies House state that total income for the same period was £442,609. It had no employees and Chris Donnelly was paid £18k for consultancy services. The accounts had been signed off by Bowker Orford Accountants, London W1.

The current directors are Donnelly, Lafayeedney, and six others:

- Anthony Cooke - 21 directorships, occupation variously given as chartered accountant, ship broker and ship owner
- Harry Hart, resident in Switzerland - no other directorships
- Philip Matthews - two previous directorships are PM Homeland Security and Astutus Intelligence
- Oliver McTernan, resident in France - former Catholic priest and co-founder of the conflict resolution charity [Forward Thinking](#) established in 2004. Chris Donnelly is a trustee of this charity. In 1992, while still a priest, McTernan founded a company named St Francis and St Sergius Trust Fund with objects including “advancement of religion within the territories of the former Soviet Union”. In 2001 this was renamed Partners in Hope and in 2011 to the [Drive Forward Foundation](#), a charity “to empower care leavers aged 16-26 in London to achieve their full potential”. A bio of McTernan on the World Economic Forum site gives more details of his career since 2000:-

Formerly, Senior Adviser, Club of Madrid. 2000-03, Visiting Fellow, Weatherhead Center for International Affairs, Harvard University. May 2002, initiated and participated in the first official high-level post conflict talks between NATO and the government in Belgrade [in 2002]; 25 years as Executive Committee Member, Pax Christi International, responsible for the movement’s East-West Dialogue programme during the Soviet period.

- Pirooska Nagy-Mohacsi - Programme Director of the Institute of Global Affairs at LSE where “she is responsible for various global policy initiatives on financial resilience, growth and migration”.
- Dr Julia Szusterman: 1986 doctorate at Oxford on Developmentalism and political change in Argentina, 1955-62

The Chief Operations Officer is listed as Guy Spindler, an [employee of the FCO](#)



## 9.2 Youth work

The Institute for Statecraft’s website [describes](#) this charitable programme run by the Institute for Statecraft as follows:

*We work with young people (aged 14-18) from minority communities in areas facing economic and social challenge. Our aim is to increase participants’ life opportunities and support them in fulfilling their potential. We achieve our objectives through offering activities that develop employability skills, provide accredited qualifications and build confidence.*

These activities include two-night Challenge Weekends at an Army base, two-day team-building exercises and Duke of Edinburgh Award programmes alongside the Army Cadet Force. The Directors’ Reports make clear that this programme is targeted specifically at Muslims. This [newsletter](#) from a school in Stepney, with predominantly Bangladeshi intake, describes a two-day trip for 30 pupils to an army camp with Shared Outcomes. There is no address or contact form on the Shared Outcomes website - only a link to the Institute for Statecraft’s website.

## 9.3 EU lobbying

The Institute of Statecraft declared two people at 0.25 FTE each for the year 2016, with annual cost given as £17,500 approximately.

## 9.4 Other companies directed by Donnelly and Lafayeedney

Donnelly and Lafayeedney are both aged 71, and share directorships in other companies. Some of these companies filed dormant accounts but appear to have been active. Some do not appear on the Companies House website but can be found on [duedil.com](#). These companies include:

- Council on Foreign Relations, a Scottish Limited Liability Partnership with three directors: Daniel Lafayeedney, Jean-Louis Lafayeedney (Daniel’s 38-year old son by his first marriage, now based in Hong Kong), and Donnelly. This is co-located with the Institute for Statecraft at the Gateside Mills address.
- ISG Corporate LLP, which also involves Donnelly and Lafayeedney. This was incorporated in Edinburgh in 2009, renamed to Innovation Services General LLP in 2011, and dissolved in 2013. This filed dormant accounts although apparently active.

The two “officers” of ISG Corporate LLP were themselves incorporated partnerships: Pluscarden Associates Partnership and Pluscarden Investments Partnership. Both have their address in Gateside Mills. Accounts for these partnerships as dormant companies were filed in 2010-2011. For Pluscarden Associates, the accounts are signed by Chris Donnelly. For Pluscarden Investments, the accounts are signed by Pierre Lafayeedney, Daniel Lafayeedney’s

second son by his first marriage. From comparisons of handwriting, it appears that Pierre's signature on the 2010 document does not correspond to his signature on other documents, but resembles his father's signature. Pluscarden Abbey is a Benedictine monastery at the end of the Moray Firth in the north of Scotland.

- Technfin London Limited: incorporated 2014, compulsory strike-off 2016

## 10 Christopher Nigel Donnelly

There is a profile of Chris Donnelly on the [Commonwealth Argosy site](#).

*As a graduate of Manchester University and reserve officer in the British Army Intelligence Corps, Chris Donnelly helped to establish, and later headed, the British Army's Soviet Studies Research Centre at RMA Sandhurst. Between 1989-2003, as Special Adviser to four NATO Secretaries General, he was closely involved in dealing with the disintegration of the Soviet Union and the reform of the newly emerging democracies in Central and Eastern Europe. He left NATO in 2003 to set up and run the UK Defence Academy's Advanced Research and Assessment Group. In 2010 he became co-Director of The Institute for Statecraft dealing with new security threats and responses – specifically, new forms of conflict and warfare and how to transform institutions so that they are fit for today's rapidly changing security environment.*

*He also: is adviser to the Foreign Minister of Lithuania; is a Security and Justice Senior Mentor in the UK's Stabilisation Unit; is Trustee of the London-based charities Active Change Foundation and Forward Thinking; serves as Honorary Colonel, SGMI*

SGMI is [Specialist Group Military Intelligence](#), based in Thatcham. The Soviet Studies Research Centre was founded in 1972 at Sandhurst. After the end of the Cold War, it became the Conflict Studies Research Centre, which became part of the Advanced Research and Assessment Group of the Defence Academy, which in turn was wound up in 2010. His honorary colonel affiliation to SGMI began in 2015, the same year that the Integrity Initiative programme started.

Although the Institute was not granted charitable status until 2009, Donnelly's name had been on the founding documents in 2006. In 2010 there was an event at Wilton Park which gives the position of Anne Bader as Director of North American Programs, Institute of Statecraft and Government, University of Oxford. So by 2010 it already had programs, and was based in Oxford though its corporate address was in Fife.

Donnelly's salary cost for running the Integrity Initiative equates to £97k / year for running the Integrity Initiative, based on the most recent budget.

## 11 Daniel Lafayeedney

It appears that his surname was originally Edney, and that he took the middle name Lafaye on marriage to his first wife Regine Lafaye, some time before October 1978. Later the two names were concatenated to Lafaye-Edney and to Lafayeedney. A forum post in 2016 refers to past service as a private military contractor in southern Africa, but there is no confirmation for this.

In October 1978, as Daniel Lafaye Edney aged 32 years, he was [commissioned](#) into the Territorial Reserve Special Air Service Regiment, Group A (23 SAS) as 2nd Lt. on probation. 19 months later, still holding the rank of 2nd Lt on probation and now known as Daniel Lafaye-Edney, he [resigned his commission](#).

23 SAS was formed as a Territorial Army (part-time military reservists) unit in 1959 by renaming the Reserve Reconnaissance Unit, which had in turn been formed from MI9, a unit with expertise in escape and evasion during the Second World War. It is now, like Specialist Group Military Intelligence, part of the [1st Intelligence, Surveillance and Reconnaissance Brigade](#).

Some time before March 1996 Lafayeedney appears to have formed a relationship with Fiona Katherine Adelaide Gatty, who is [listed in an online directory of the peerage](#) as the mother of Lafayeedney's youngest son born in December 1996, although she and her first husband were not divorced until 2003.

Fiona Gatty [describes herself](#) as “an Art Historian specialising in late 18th- and early 19th-century French aesthetics with an extensive finance and business background in the high net worth family business and entrepreneurial sector.” She holds a post-doctoral research fellow post in Somerville College Oxford and is Program Officer for the Templeton World Charity Foundation, a charity that has been [criticized](#) for its past support of creationism and climate change denialist groups.

Lafayeedney and other members of his family have over the years held directorships of the [property company](#) set up in 2001 that owns the Gateside Mills site. Of the two current directors, one is Fiona Gatty who holds 19% of the equity. Half the equity is held by [FW Investments Limited](#), a company based in Cheshire.

Lafayeedney's business activities as a property developer led to an acrimonious case which [came before the High Court in 2006](#) in which he attempted to deny the claim of Mr Garry Bramley that there was a written agreement on a 50/50 split of the profits on a property deal for which Bramley had lent Lafayeedney £350,000. The judge made scathing comments on Lafayeedney's testimony:

\_there were certain specific matters, identified in Section B2 below, where I am bound to conclude that Mr Lafayeedney was not telling me the truth.

The judge commented with evident distaste on Lafayeedney's business model for his property deals:

*However it appears that the real profit was made from the complex inter-company*

*arrangments, whereby it was the off-shore vehicle that sold the site to the Housing Association, thus sheltering the profit on the sale from any liability to Capital Gains Tax.*

This had led to an Inland Revenue investigation into Lafayeedney's affairs in 2004. The judge commented unfavourably on the character of both men:

*In my judgement, it was entirely in character that each man, during their oral evidence, made allegations or insinuations of criminal conduct on the part of the other. For example, Mr Bramley alleged that, at one meeting Mr Lafayeedney explored with him the possibility of an innocent third party taking the consequences of the Inland Revenue investigation, whilst, for his part, Mr Lafayeedney said that Mr Bramley told him that he had not paid tax in 16 years.*

In the same year (2006), he was described as a Scottish 'multi-millionaire property developer', in an [account](#) of his daughter's marriage to Lord Seymour, heir to the Duke of Somerset.

## 12 St Antony's College Oxford and the Pluscarden Programme

On the [current website](#) of St. Antony's College Oxford, Lafayeedney is listed as a 'benefactor.'

*The co-founder and Director of The Institute for Statecraft, has wide experience in international affairs, working with both the UK and foreign Governments. As Senior Associate Fellow at the Advanced Research and Assessment Group at the Defence Academy of the UK (2004- 2010) he specialised in the development and implementation of capacity-building projects for high-level governance of the security sector in European and middle-Eastern countries, and in supporting the development of counter-radicalisation programmes for at-risk ethnic communities in the UK. His military service, legal background and career as an entrepreneur have given him an understanding of the importance of the link between business and national security.*

*He is a Senior Member, St Antony's College, University of Oxford, Member of The Law Society of Scotland holds a degree in Scots Law from the University of Aberdeen and a Diploma in International Comparative Law from San Diego University, USA.*

His position from 2004 as Senior Associate Fellow at ARAG would have put him close to Donnelly, who had set it up. It is clear from their history of working together that Donnelly and Lafayeedney trust each other. This suggests that their relationship may go back a long way, possibly to active military service together before Lafaeedney's documented military service, which consists only of 19 months as 2nd Lt on probation as a part-time reservist.

From enquiries among others involved we have established that the funding for the Pluscarden program was donated by Daniel Lafayeedney and Fiona Gatty. Daniel Lafayeedney was on

the [Management Committee](#), though in the College Record he does not appear as Director as is stated in his biographic sketch on the College website. Fiona Gatty (under her married name MacLeod) appears on the Advisory Committee. On her CV she lists her role in the Pluscarden programme as co-founder and member of Advisory Committee as from 2004 to 2013.

As the Inland Revenue had begun an investigation into Lafayeedney in 2004, this might not have been the best time for him to make a substantial donation of his own money to an Oxford college. It is possible that the donation came from one or more of the companies and partnerships named Pluscarden that Lafayeedney had set up. One of these was [Pluscarden Investments LLP](#), registered in Glasgow as a Scottish Limited LLP on 12 October 2005 with Dan Lafayeedney and Fiona Gatty as directors. Donnelly was also involved in these companies having signed the accounts of Pluscarden Associates as a dormant company. Gatty mentions on her CV her role in an earlier company: “Pluscarden Investments – Self Employed Corporate Finance Business Partner (May 1995 - April 2007)”. This suggests that these companies may have been set up ten years earlier.

The [Pluscarden Programme](#) began in 2005. The academic director was Steve Tsang, a China specialist. A [report](#) of its first year of operation is available in the St Antony’s College record. The level of activity of the Pluscarden Programme appears to have been modest: during its first year it held [two seminars per term and a large international workshop in December](#). Delegates had to pay a £400 registration fee for the workshop. The first annual Pluscarden conference was designated by NATO as one of its Advanced Research Workshops, entitled ‘The Changing Face of Intelligence’ held over two days in December 2005. Pluscarden’s meetings during its first year included three Israelis with an academic or military background as speakers or session chairs: Professor Yoram Dinstein, General Yaa’cov Amidor, Professor Itzik Ben-Israel. Lafayeedney attended the Herzliya Conference in Israel on 21-24 January 2007, and his [affiliation](#) is given as BICOM (Britain Israel Communications and Research Centre), an [active pro-Israeli lobbying group](#) underwritten by Chaim “Poju” Zabłudowicz, a London-based property developer. The attendance list also includes Donnelly and Zabłudowicz. Other than a [document from the Italian Senate](#) dated 2017 that links the Institute of Statecraft with the Herzliya Institute of Counter-Terrorism in a NATO-supported research project, there is no other evidence that Lafayeedney and Donnelly were supporters of pro-Israeli organizations.

## 13 Charities with Donnelly and Lafayeedney as trustees

### 13.1 Forward Thinking

Founded by Oliver McTernan in 2004, Chris Donnelly is one of six trustees. Its stated aims are:-

*To promote a more inclusive peace process in the Middle East. To facilitate political dialogues in, and between, the Arab/Muslim and Western worlds. To*

*promote in the UK greater understanding and confidence between the diverse grassroots Muslim communities and the wider society including the Media and the British establishment.*

Yusuf Desai, listed as UK programme regional director for Forward Thinking, is listed as a Fellow in the Office Core Team of the UK Cluster of the Integrity Initiative.

## 13.2 Active Change Foundation

Active Change Foundation was registered in 2008 and based in Walthamstow, with a stated aim to “prevent the spread of violent street crime, gang related issues, community tensions & violent extremism in all its forms”. The five trustees in 2016 [included](#) Chris Donnelly, David Gilbertson and Dan Lafayeedney (a rare photo). In October 2017 all three of these resigned or retired.

Those involved in Active Change Foundation report that it was Oliver McTernan who introduced Active Change Foundation to Chris Donnelly, and Chris Donnelly who in turn brought in Dan Lafayeedney. The Shared Outcomes programme appears to have originated in this link.

## 14 Council on Foreign Relations LLP

A company named [Council on Foreign Relations](#) was incorporated as a Scottish Limited Liability Partnership in February 2010, five months after the Institute became a Scottish charity. The Scottish LLP has filed accounts as a dormant company since it was set up in 2010. Its registered address is the Gateshead Mills building, same as the Institute for Statecraft. The three current directors are Chris Donnelly, Daniel Lafayeedney and Jean-Louis Lafayeedney. Oliver McTernan (see above) and Lesley Simm were directors from 2010 to 2013. [Lesley Sim](#), now retired, was a civil servant at the Defence Academy’s Advanced Research and Assessment Group with a specialism in Islamist movements.

This Scottish LLP has the same name as the [US think-tank](#) CFR founded in 1921, but has no connection with it (confirmed to us by CFR’s General Counsel). It is surprising that the founders of this Scottish LLP chose the name Council on Foreign Relations, which could easily be confused with the august and respected US foreign policy thinktank of the same name.

## 15 Scottish Limited Partnerships and Limited Liability Partnerships

Scottish Limited Partnerships (SLPs) are different to Limited Partnerships in England and Wales: a registered Scottish Limited Partnership can hold assets in its own name, as well as

owning assets, entering into contracts, borrowing money and owning property. A Scottish Limited Liability Partnership (LLP) differs from an SLP in that each partner is afforded limited liability protection against any debts, losses or lawsuits as a result of malpractice. Although SLPs and Scottish LLPs can be set up only in Scotland, they are regulated by UK law and the Scottish Government has no powers to regulate them,

A [press release](#) from the Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy on 12 April 2018 noted that although Scottish Limited Partnerships are used by legitimate businesses, there was “growing evidence SLPs have been exploited in complex money laundering schemes” The Business Minister Andrew Griffiths was quoted as saying that although the UK has taken a leading role in the fight against money laundering “Scottish Limited Partnerships are being abused to carry out all manner of crimes abroad – from foreign money laundering to arms dealing.” Other [investigations](#) have documented that Scottish Limited Partnerships carried out such activities even when they were filing accounts as dormant companies

## 16 Physical location

Both the charity The Institute for Statecraft and the LLP Council on Foreign Relations have their registered address as Gateside Mills, a tiny hamlet on the river Eden near Auchtermuchty in Fife. On [Google Streetview](#), images taken in the spring show the buildings converted mill converted to craft workshops for interior design, with a shop opposite. A visitor on 29 November 2018 found that the Gateside Mills building was derelict and [being demolished](#).

There is no other mention of a physical address for the Institute, or even a phone number. The only way to contact the Institute is by filling in a form on the website. The UK Cluster document lists an Office Core Team consisting of 15 Fellows and three Associates. The internal handbook refers to “the office” but does not indicate its location. In the grant applications to the FCO the address is given as

The Institute for Statecraft 2 Temple Place London WC2R 3BD 07974 019 212

The phone number is an EE mobile number. 2TP (2 Temple Place) is a historic building, completed in 1895 by William Waldorf Astor and now owned by a charity. The office space appears to be in the basement. The budget documents do not include any provision for office costs. This suggests that office space is being provided or office rental costs are being paid by some other agency in the public or private sector. A possible reason for concealing this is that if the identity of this provider were known the independence of the Institute for Statecraft would be called into question.



## 17 Charitable status of the Institute of Statecraft

### 17.1 Publicly declared charitable purposes and privately stated objectives

The Institute for Statecraft is [registered](#) as a Scottish charity. The charitable objects in the constitution are stated as follows:

\_\_ (1) To advance education in the fields of governance and statecraft, and in particular focussing on the leadership, direction, management and administration of public and private institutions, major organisations and other bodies (whether incorporated or otherwise), and the skills needed by those in authority within such institutions, organisations or bodies to enable them to deal effectively with current and future challenges particularly in respect of security

\_\_ (2) To advance human rights, conflict resolution and/or reconciliation and religious/racial/ethnic harmony, to promote equality and diversity, citizenship and community development, and to advance national and international security; and in particular through assisting governments (including emerging democracies and countries in transition) and other institutions, organisations or bodies (whether in the UK or abroad) to respond to the challenges posed by new developments in the world (whether social, political, economic or technological) and to develop and embed structures and institutions that reflect principles of best practice in governance and statecraft.

The [statement](#) released in response to the November 2018 leak says that the Integrity Initiative is set up to “counter disinformation by states and sub-state actors.”

*The Integrity Initiative is a partnership of several independent institutions led by The Institute for Statecraft. This international public programme was set up in 2015 to counter disinformation and other forms of malign influence being conducted by states and sub-state actors seeking to interfere in democratic processes and to undermine public confidence in national political institutions*

This would be a charitable purpose, if it included disinformation by all states including our own. But the internal handbook and the grant make clear that the Integrity Initiative is solely directed at Russia.

*The Integrity Initiative was set up in autumn 2015 by The Institute for Statecraft in cooperation with the Free University of Brussels (VUB) to bring to the attention of politicians, policy-makers, opinion leaders and other interested parties the threat posed by Russia to democratic institutions in the United Kingdom, across Europe and North America.*

The 2017-2018 [application form](#) also states that the programme is specifically directed against Russia:



*To counter Russian disinformation and malign influence in Europe by: expanding the knowledge base; harnessing existing expertise, and; establishing a network of networks of experts, opinion formers and policy makers, to educate national audiences in the threat and to help build national capacities to counter it.*

Some of the activities of the Integrity Initiative in Ukraine and the Baltic States seem directed at conflict promotion rather than conflict resolution.

The [applicants' response to the FCO's reviewers](#) shows that the Integrity Initiative is under close supervision from the FCO.

The applicants begin with a summary of the “top three deliverables for FCO”. This implies a customer-contractor relationship which calls into question the independence of the Institute of Statecraft - charities are supposed to act independently of government influence. The top three “deliverables” are listed as:-

*Developing and proving the cluster concept and methodology - lists “Jelena Milic silencing pro-kremlin voices on Serbian TV” as an example*

*Making people (in Government, think tanks, military, journalists) see the big picture, making people acknowledge that we are under concerted, deliberate hybrid attack by Russia*

*Increasing the speed of response, mobilising the network to activism in pursuit of the “golden minute” - lists “Recent example from Spain of our influencing the appointment of the pro-Kremlin candidate within a few hours of the announcement”*

Silencing dissenters and blocking their appointment to public posts are not charitable purposes.

## **17.2 Office of the Scottish Charity Regulator's criteria for making a complaint:**

The criteria listed on the website are:

*Charities that are being used for private gain*

*Where a charity's independence is being called into question. We expect charity trustees to act independently of any private, government or political interest*

*When it is not clear who is in charge of the charity. For example: one charity trustee seems to be in overall control of the charity, an employee seems to be in overall control of the charity, or none of the charity trustees is taking responsibility - this can result in serious governance problems, which could harm the charity*

*When it appears that the charity's assets are at risk or not being used for charitable purposes*

*The charity is not carrying out the charitable purposes defined in its governing document*

The Integrity initiative, which accounts for most of the Institute for Statecraft's budget, raises concerns on all these criteria:

- it is not acting independently of government and political interests
- there are governance problems: the lack of an identified physical office
- the charity's assets are not being used for charitable purposes
- the charity is not carrying out the charitable purposes listed in its governing document

We do not know whether the charity is being used for private gain, but concerns are raised by the setup of a co-located Scottish LLP that could easily be confused with an existing organization of the same name, and by the comments made in the High Court judgement in 2006 on Lafayeedney's character and business methods.

## 18 The Scottish angle

The Scottish components of the story are:-

1. The now derelict Gateside Mills address where IoS and the Council on Foreign Relations LLP are co-located.
2. The role of David Leask in Integrity Initiative's social media team, and his attack on Neil Findlay MSP as part of an effort to rehabilitate someone who has been widely described as a Nazi. Other studies have [implicated](#) Parubiy's group in the (false flag) massacre of Maidan protesters.
3. It is plausible that the Integrity Initiative was behind the attack launched by The Times on 14 April 2018 on the Working Group, and on the University of Edinburgh itself when they failed to find anything to smear the Edinburgh academics with.
4. The obvious incompatibility of Integrity Initiative's activities with the Institute for Statecraft's status as a Scottish charity

## 19 Acknowledgements

We thank Max Blumenthal for pointing us to additional sources.

- other acknowledgements to be added